

Attachment #15

Forest Service Leaders Stress that the USFS Bases it's Projects on Best Science

USFS leader statement on best science #1 - "The agency has been able to face changing and challenging times and incorporate new information based on science."

"I am very much involved in trying to integrate the science and the management sides of the Forest Service. It's very, very important that we conduct that integration, because our management decisions are scientifically based, and there is an ever increasing need for more scientific information."

Excerpts from an interview with Hilda Diaz-Soltero
Associate Chief for Natural Resources, USDA Forest Service
Women in Natural Resources, Vol. 21, No. 3
August 2000

<http://www.fs.fed.us/publications/2000/00nov02-Hilda-Diaz-Soltero-Interview.pdf>

Forest Response: Interview, not scientific publication.

USFS leader statement on best science #2 - "Forest Service managers strive to use the **best science** available in their decision making."

Dr. Ann Bartuska, Deputy Chief for Research and Development, USDA Forest Service
Excerpt from testimony before the House Resources Forest and Forest Health
Subcommittee
July 15, 2004

<http://www.fs.fed.us/congress/108/house/oversight/bartuska/071504.html>

Forest Response: Testimony, not scientific publication.

USFS leader statement on best science #3 - "We are committed to accomplishing the aggressive treatments planned in the President's Budget for FY 2005 using new authorities in the Healthy Forests Restoration Act that improve the condition class of the nation's watersheds and thus protect communities and resources for future generations, and our Research Station directors are committed to providing the Forest Service with the **best science** available."

Dale Bosworth Chief, USDA Forest Service
Excerpt from a statement before the Committee on Energy and Natural Resources
United States Senate
March 3, 2004
<http://www.pirate4x4.com/forum/land-use-issues/232684-statement-dale-n-bosworth-chief-usda-forest-service.html>

Forest Response: Statement, not scientific publication.

USFS leader statement on best science #4 - "Our direction will address these emerging issues to ensure it is based on the available **best science**."

Sally Collins Associate Chief USDA Forest Service
Excerpt from testimony before the Committee on Energy and Natural Resources, United States Senate
July 11, 2006
<http://www.fs.fed.us/congress/109/senate/oversight/collins/071106.html>

Forest Response: Statement, not scientific publication.

USFS leader statement on best science #5 - "The American people have come to expect us to use the best science, and we ought to use the **best science**." (pg.4)

Dale N. Bosworth Chief USDA Forest Service
Excerpt from a speech on *Sustainable Management of the National Forests*,
at the Andrus Center for Public Policy, Boise State University
December 12, 2001
http://www.andruscenter.org/images/transcripts/Sustainable_transcript.pdf

Forest Response: Statement, not scientific publication.

USFS leader statement on best science #6 - "Always use the **best science**. Science can't decide for us, but it can help us understand the consequences of our decisions. Forest Service Research and others in academia can deliver some of the best science and technical resources to help inform how these special areas should be managed for the long term."

Sally Collins Associate Chief USDA Forest Service
Excerpt from a speech to the Land Trust Alliance Rally "Protecting Open Spaces:
Partners in a Common Cause"
October 31, 2004
<http://www.fs.fed.us/news/2004/speeches/10/open-spaces.shtml>

Forest Response: Statement, not scientific publication.

USFS leader statement on best science #7 - "The new rule directs forest managers to use the **best science** available to protect species at a landscape level. The emphasis is to preserve ecosystems as a whole."

Statement by Heidi Valetkevitch
National Media Officer USDA Forest Service
to Joe Bauman, reporter for the *Deseret Morning News*
December 24, 2004
<http://www.deseretnews.com/article/600100084/New-forest-rules-focus-on-holistic-approach.html>

Forest Response: Statement, not scientific publication.

USFS leader statement on best science #8 - On June 29, 2007, Chief of the Forest Service, Gail Kimbell expressed her support of employees participating in professional societies. The following is an excerpt from her support letter:

“As stewards of forests and rangelands, we must respond to the many challenges of managing a wide variety of resources and values. To meet these various challenges, a diverse and highly qualified cadre of natural resource and other professionals is critical to assure that management approaches are based on the **best science**. More than ever, it is important for each of us to continue to learn, enhance our resource knowledge, and develop innovative approaches to cooperatively conserve this Nation’s natural resources.” (pg. 5)

Brown, Joel “**Power to the People!**”
SRM Rangeland News, November 2007
<http://www.rangelands.org/RN/Nov.RN07.pdf>

Forest Response: Newsletter/opinion.

USFS leader statement on best science #9 - “The Forest Service must be a leader in using the **best science** and the best managers to accomplish what I think is one of the noblest, most important callings of our generation bringing people together and helping them find ways to live within the limits of the land.” (Pg. 30)

Statement by Chief Dr. Mike Dombeck
“**Forest Chief Shifts focus to clean water**”
April 1998 *TRANSITIONS*
<http://www.waterplanet.ws/transitions/tr9804/>

Forest Response: Statement, not scientific publication.

USFS leader statement on best science #10 - “We have made great progress under New Perspectives to get land managers and scientists working together as a team in doing the best job possible. Let’s keep it up and make sure our decisions reflect the **best science** and close the gap between the level of scientific knowledge and its application in our day-to-day management.”

Chief F. Dale Robertson

From FIVE YEAFt REVIEW - B-3 # #

http://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE_DOCUMENTS/fsbdev3_053856.pdf

Forest Response: Statement, not scientific publication.

USFS leader statement on best science #11 - “In 1994 Chief Jack Ward Thomas of the U.S. Forest Service invited private foundations to join the USFS and other federal resource management agencies in co-funding a national workshop designed to bring the **best science**, broadly defined, to an 11-day workshop of agency natural resource managers.¹ Having a science background himself, Thomas wanted to capture the scientific underpinnings of ecosystem dynamics in order to establish a more solid basis for sustainable resource management. Private foundations, invited for the first time to join the Forest Service in this way, would, Thomas felt, add legitimacy and assist in bringing in scientific talent from outside the government.”

Smith, Ted “*Chief's Ecosystem Stewardship Conference Workshop Review*”

Eco-Watch, February 26, 1996

<http://www.fs.fed.us/eco/eco-watch/ew960226.htm>

Forest Response: Conference transcripts, not scientific publication.

USFS leader statement on best science #12 - "Our challenge is to protect all the different uses of our forests which well-kept roads undoubtedly serve while protecting these remaining untouched places. This is a long and delicate process. It will not happen overnight. We must rely on the **best science** and broad-based public participation. But in the interim, I am prepared to authorize an 18-month moratorium on the construction of new roads in the last pristine areas of our national forests."

Agriculture Secretary Dan Glickman
From an Announcement of Interim Ban on Forest Road Construction
Washington, D.C., February 11, 1999
<http://www.ibiblio.org/london/permaculture/permaculture-list-archives-1999-2002/msg04621.html>

Forest Response: Announcement, not scientific publication.

USFS leader statement on best science #13 - "We have some of the **best science**, and we need to make sure we're applying that, using that and sharing that as we move forward. I think we have a key leadership role, not only in the application of science but to help inform and educate our community and the folks we work with."

Statement by USFS Chief Tom Tidwell
From an interview with Rob Chaney of the *Missoulian*, June 19, 2009
<http://westinstenv.org/sosf/2009/06/19/tidwell-interviewed-by-the-missoulian/>

Forest Response: Statement, not scientific publication.

USFS leader statement on best science #14 - "Since that time, they have consulted with a wide array of scientists in the Forest Service, other agencies, universities, and consultants, with the aim of arriving at a consensus on the **best science** available to address this issue."

Potyondy, John P. 2007 "**The Evolution of Channel Maintenance Science in the Forest Service**"
Mr. Potyondy is the WO Watershed, Fish, Wildlife, Air, and Rare Plants Staff

<http://www.stream.fs.fed.us/afsc/pdfs/Potyondy.pdf>

USFS leader statement on best science #15 - “The FS manages the National Forest System's natural resources with a commitment to long term ecosystem sustainability, multiple use, local community involvement and economic stability, interaction of social and cultural values with forest resource management, and the use of management practices based on the **best science** available.”

Melle, Ann R. “**The U.S. Forest Service Approach to Forest Law Enforcement**”
A presentation to the East Asia Ministerial Conference, September 12, 2001
Ms. Melle is the Asst. Director of Law Enforcement and Investigations, USDS Forest Service
<http://www.for.gov.bc.ca/hfd/library/documents/bib49682.pdf>

Forest Response: Presentation.

USFS leader statement on best science #16 - “ “The responsible policy maker ought to seek out the **best science**, because ultimately that will yield the best result.”. “

“To put things in perspective, Dombeck says, "Science should not be the only driver of policy; there are economic, social and political concerns, but ... scientists can provide information that informs policymaking; 'If we adopt this policy, this will be the outcome,' and that certainly does not appear to be happening.” “

Statements by retired Chief Dr. Mike Dombeck
“Politics vs. Science,” October 19, 2006
Published by the University of Wisconsin, Board of Regents.
http://whyfiles.org/247sci_politics/index.php?q=5.txt

Forest Response: Statement/Opinion.

USFS leader statement on best science #17 - “Carefully done science can provide common ground for agreement among different stakeholders, enabling communities to unify.”

“The **best science** available tells us that at some point we must reinstall this missing ecosystem process so the natural machinery functions properly again.” (pg. 9)

Kaufmann, Merrill R. 2005 “**Good Fire,Bad Fire**”

Mr. Kaufmann is the Rocky Mountain Research Station's team leader for ecosystem management

Fort Collins, CO, USDA Forest Service

http://csfs.colostate.edu/pdfs/Good_Fire_Bad_Fire.pdf

FS Response: Link unavailable.

USFS leader statement on best science #18 - “The general objective of this Symposium was to build on the **best science** and technology available to assure that the data and information produced in future inventory and monitoring programs are comparable, quality assured, available, and adequate for their intended purposes, thereby providing a reliable framework for characterization, assessment, and management of forest ecosystems in North America.”

Bravo, Aguirre Celedonio and Carlos Rodriguez Franco, compilers

1999. **North American Science Symposium: Toward a Unified**

Framework for Inventorying and Monitoring Forest Ecosystem Resources.

Guadalajara, Mexico (November 2-6,1998). Proceedings RMRS-P-12. U.S.

Department of Agriculture, Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Research Station

http://cwt33.ecology.uga.edu/publications/pubs_martha_new_01282003/Batch_2_@300dpi/PDF/1389.pdf

Forest Response: USDA publication. Agreed.

USFS leader statement on best science #19 - “The experience of the Zaca Fire demonstrates a window of opportunity to improve the link between science and management. A major concern often expressed in both fire research and fire management circles is that there is a lot of science being produced, but very little that can or is being incorporated (depending on your perspective) into fire management. There may be a current opening to change that state of affairs.”

McDaniel, Josh 2007 “The Zaca Fire: Bridging Fire Science and Management”
Widland Fire Lessons Learned,
<http://www.wildfirelessons.net/Additional.aspx>

FS Response: Link broken.

USFS leader statement on best science #20 - “Accordingly, we find that the Final EIS fails to disclose and discuss responsible opposing scientific viewpoints in the final statement itself in violation of NEPA and the implementing regulations. We therefore reverse the district court's grant of summary judgment and remand to the district court with directions that it remand the final statement to the Forest Service for further proceedings consistent with this opinion. See *Vitarelli v. Seaton*, 359 U.S. 535, 545, 79 S.Ct. 968, 3 L.Ed.2d 1012 (1959) (standing for the well-established principle that an agency is generally required to follow its regulations); see also *Cal. v. Block*, 690 F.2d at 769 (“Agencies are . . . obliged to adhere to the procedures mandated by NEPA.”) (citing *Vt. Yankee Nuclear Power Corp. v. Natural Res. Def. Council, Inc.*, 435 U.S. 519, 549 n. 21, 98 S.Ct. 1197, 55 L.Ed.2d 460 (1978)).
REVERSED AND REMANDED.”

CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY v. UNITED STATES FOREST SERVICE
Argued and Submitted July 15, 2003. -- November 18, 2003
Before: KLEINFELD, WARDLAW, Circuit Judges, and POGUE, Judge.
In the United States Court of Appeals, Ninth Circuit
<http://caselaw.findlaw.com/us-9th-circuit/1173711.html>

FS Response: Law brief for and EIS in Arizona. Not relevant to this project.